



USDC SDNY  
DOCUMENT  
ELECTRONICALLY FILED  
DOC #:  
DATE FILED: 8/28/2020

August 28, 2020

**VIA ECF FILING**

The Honorable Analisa Torres  
Daniel Patrick Moynihan  
United States Courthouse  
500 Pearl St.  
New York, NY 10007-1312

**Re: *Graham, et. al v. National Beverage Corp.*, No. 19-cv-873**

Dear Judge Torres:

Plaintiffs in the above-referenced case write to request permission to publicly file a redacted copy of their pre-motion letter regarding their anticipated motion for summary judgment, as well as their accompanying Rule 56.1 statement and Defendant's response thereto.

The standards for filing documents under seal in this Circuit were first set forth in *Lugosch v. Pyramid Co. of Onondaga*, 435 F.3d 110, 119 (2d Cir. 2006). In that case, the Second Circuit stated that the "common law right of public access" attaches to "judicial documents", which are those documents "relevant to the performance of the judicial function and useful in the judicial process." *Id.* In deciding requests such as this one, the Court needs to balance competing considerations against the right of public access. *Id.* at 120. Valid competing considerations exist where the disclosure of confidential information would subject a party to "financial harm" or cause a party "significant competitive disadvantage." *Standard Inv. Chartered Inc. v. Fin. Indus. Reg. Auth., Inds.*, 347 Fed App'x 615, 617 (2d Cir. 2009).

Here, the proposed redacted information has been designated "highly confidential – attorneys' eyes only" by Defendant and various third parties, on the ground that the information constitutes trade secrets and are sensitive and proprietary information, the disclosure of which could have significant competitive impact on the designating parties' business. *See Awestruck Mktg. Group, LLC v. Black Ops Productions, LLC*, 16-cv-3639 (RJS), 2016 WL 8814349, at \*2 (S.D.N.Y. June 20, 2016) (granting motion to seal client list because it "contains sensitive and proprietary information that is not generally publicly available and that, if revealed, could cause significant competitive harm"); *Encyclopedia Brown Prods., Ltd. v. HBO, Inc.*, 26 F. Supp. 2d 606, 613-14 (S.D.N.Y. 1998) (granting request to seal confidential business information and trade secrets that

were commercially valuable to defendants because disclosure would cause irreparable harm, outweighing the public's interest in access to it). Plaintiffs take no position as to Defendant's and third parties' designations.

Pursuant to this Court's Individual Rules, Section IV(A)(ii), contemporaneously filed herewith are the proposed redacted documents (publicly filed), and the unredacted documents with proposed redactions highlighted (filed under seal). In addition, copies of all unredacted documents have been submitted to Court and counsel via electronic email.

For reasons stated above, Plaintiffs respectfully request leave to publicly file a redacted copy of the referenced documents.

Respectfully submitted,

**GREG COLEMAN LAW PC**

/s/ Greg Coleman

Greg Coleman  
Rachel Soffin  
Lisa A. White  
800 S. Gay Street, Suite 1100  
Knoxville, TN 37929  
Telephone: (865) 247-0080  
greg@gregcolemanlaw.com  
rachel@gregcolemanlaw.com  
lisa@gregcolemanlaw.com

**SIMMONS HANLY CONROY**

Mitchell M. Breit  
112 Madison Avenue  
New York, NY 10016  
Telephone: (212) 784-6400  
mbreit@simmonsfirm.com

**BARBAT, MANSOUR, SUCIU PLLC**

Nick Suciu III  
1644 Bracken Rd.  
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48302  
Telephone: (313) 303-3472  
nicksuciu@bmslawyers.com

**BRUSCA LAW, PLLC**

Lauren Brusca  
221 NE Ivanhoe Blvd.  
Suite 200

Orlando, FL 32804  
Telephone: (407) 501-6564  
lauren@brusca-law.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

CC: ALL COUNSEL OF RECORD VIA ECF

GRANTED. The proposed redactions consist of proprietary information concerning the formulation of Defendant's products. Defendant's interest in protecting that sensitive information outweighs the presumption of public access to judicial documents, at least while the Court is merely considering the parties' pre-motion letters.

SO ORDERED.

Dated: August 28, 2020  
New York, New York



---

ANALISA TORRES  
United States District Judge